

Audit of
School Bus Safety Inspections
May 19, 2017

Report #2017-03



MISSION STATEMENT

The School Board of Palm Beach County is committed to providing a world class education with excellence and equity to empower each student to reach his or her highest potential with the most effective staff to foster the knowledge, skills, and ethics required for responsible citizenship and productive careers.

Robert M. Avossa, Ed.D.
Superintendent of Schools

School Board Members

Chuck Shaw, Chairman
Debra L. Robinson, M.D., Vice Chairwoman
Marcia Andrews
Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq.
Karen M. Brill
Barbara McQuinn
Erica Whitfield

Audit Committee Members

Noah Silver, CPA, Chairman
David H. Talley, Vice Chairman
Tammy McDonald Anderson
N. Ronald Bennett, CPA
Michael Dixon, CPA/PFS
Deborah Manzo
Richard Roberts, CPA

Audit Committee Representatives

Frank A. Barbieri, Jr., Esq., School Board
Robert M. Avossa, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools
Mike Burke, Chief Financial Officer
JulieAnn Rico, Esq., General Counsel
Maureen Werner, Principal Representative
Kathryn Gundlach, CTA President

**Audit of
School Bus Safety Inspections
Table of Contents**

	Page
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	i
PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY	1
SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY	1
BACKGROUND	2
CONCLUSIONS	
1. Child Alert and Camera Systems	3
I. OIG’s May 2016 On-Site Observations	3
II. OIG’s Follow-Up On-Site Observations in September 2016	5
2. 392 School Bus Safety Inspections at West Compound During July 2014 Through May 2016 Conducted by an Inspector With Expired Certification	8
3. 5% of Sample Safety Inspections Performed Beyond the Maximum 30-School-Day Interval Requirement	9
EXHIBITS	
1. Sample Child Alert System with Manually Disconnected Wiring	11
2. Bus Driver and Attendance Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report	12
3. School Bus Safety Inspection Form	13
APPENDIX	
Management’s Response	15

This page intentionally left blank.

Audit of
School Bus Safety Inspections
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's (OIG) 2015-16 Work Plan*, we have audited the School Bus Safety Inspections during Fiscal Year 2016. The primary objectives of this audit were to determine (1) if Post-Trip Passenger Check (Child Alert) and Video Surveillance Camera (Camera) Systems on school buses were in working conditions, (2) if school bus inspections were conducted by certified inspectors, and (3) if school buses were inspected within the required time interval. The audit produced the following major conclusions.

1. Child Alert and Camera Systems

During the audit, OIG conducted two on-site observations to determine if the Post-Trip Passenger Check System (Child Alert) and Video Surveillance Camera (Camera) equipment on school buses were functioning as intended.

The Child Alert System is required for all buses manufactured since 2005. Specifically, *Inspection Procedures A.16.d.* of the Florida Department of Education's (DOE) *School Bus Safety Inspection Manual* states "*Check for proper operation of post-trip passenger check system (required on buses manufactured since 2005)*", and repair the system if it "*does not operate according to manufacturer's specifications, or is not working*".

The requirements for the Child Alert System contained in the DOE's *School Bus Specifications*, states that "*The bus must be equipped with a system to require the driver to walk to the rearmost interior of the bus after each trip to deactivate the system via a push button and to ensure that no passengers are left on the bus.*"

I. OIG's May 2016 On-Site Observations

During May 11 through 24, 2016, OIG conducted on-site observations of the Child Alert and Camera Systems on 89 sample school buses at the District's six bus compounds.

Results: 65% of Child Alert Not Working and 35% of Child Alert Manually Disconnected/Disabled on Sample Buses. Our observations found that 58 (65%) of the sample buses had non-working Child Alert, and six (7%) had non-working Camera. Furthermore, the Child Alert System on 31 (35%) of the sample buses with non-working Child Alert were manually disconnected/disabled by someone.

Corrective Actions Reported by Transportation. To ensure safety for all students and employees, on June 9, 2016, OIG provided observation results and preliminary conclusions to the Chief Operating Officer and Director of Transportation for immediate corrective actions. On August 9, 2016, Transportation informed the OIG that only 18 (2%) and nine (1%) buses had non-working Child Alert and Camera respectively

II. OIG's Follow-Up On-Site Observations in September 2016

On September 7 and 8, 2016, OIG performed a follow-up on-site observations of the safety devices for another 61 sample buses at all six bus compounds, in order to ascertain the status of corrective actions reported by Transportation. These 61 sample buses were randomly selected from those buses that were in service and had been transporting students during those two days.

Results: 21% Child Alert Not Working and 2% Child Alert Manually Disconnected. The follow-up observations found that the non-working Child Alert equipment has reduced significantly from 65% down to 21% of the sample buses. However, we noted that 11 (18%) of the sample buses had non-working Child Alert, including 10 (16%) with system failure, and one (2%) manually disconnected; and two (3%) had non-working Camera; and two (3%) had both non-working Child Alert and Camera.

Mandatory Monthly Safety Inspections Not Effective in Identifying Defective Devices. Both Child Alert and Camera Systems are part of the required monthly safety inspections. Our review of the latest *Mandatory Safety Inspection Forms* found that only two of the 13 buses with non-working Child Alert observed by OIG were noted non-working devices on the *Inspection Forms*; all the other sample buses with non-working devices were not identified on the *Inspection Forms*.

Daily Pre-Trip and Post-Trip Inspection Reports. Pursuant to *Florida Board of Education Rule 6A-3.0171, FAC*, and *Florida Statute Section 316.6135*, bus drivers are required “to inspect the bus at least daily prior to the beginning of the first daily trip or more often as required by the school district” and “to perform a complete interior inspection of each bus after each run and trip to ensure no students are left on board.” District’s procedures require bus drivers to perform daily Pre- and Post-Trip Inspections and document the inspection results on the *Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report*. Our September 7 and 8, 2016, follow-up on-site observations found 13 (21%) of the 61 sample buses had non-working Child Alert. On September 21, 2016, Transportation provided OIG with the September 7, 2016, *Pre/Post-trip Inspection Reports* for 12 of the 13 buses. All 12 *Inspection Reports* did not indicate that there were problems with the Child Alert, which were contrary to the OIG follow-up observation results.

Management’s Response: *Management concurs. Actions have been taken to correct the issues cited.*

2. 392 School Bus Safety Inspections at West Compound During July 2014 through May 2016 Conducted by an Inspector With Expired Certification

The review of 140 *Safety Inspection Forms* for 70 sample buses during Fiscal Year 2016 disclosed that 24 sample inspections were conducted by an inspector with expired certification, and seven *Safety Inspection Forms* were not signed/initialed by the supervisor.

According to Florida Department of Education, the concerned inspector was previously certified but “*His certificate expired on June 30, 2014, when he was reassigned.*”

Transportation’s records indicated that this non-certified inspector conducted 392 school bus safety inspections during July 2014 and May 2016, and did not conduct school bus safety inspection since May 12, 2016.

Management’s Response: Management concurs. Certification status is now monitored daily by a Facility Management Support Technician.

3. 5% of Sample Safety Inspections Performed Beyond the Maximum 30-School-Day Interval Requirement

Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 6A-3.0171(8)(c) Responsibilities of School Boards for Student Transportation, requires, “*Inspection of buses shall be scheduled and performed at a maximum interval of thirty (30) school days*”.

Transportation manages all District vehicles through the fleet maintenance management software, AssetWorks System. We reviewed 240 random samples of safety inspection records for 120 buses during Fiscal Year 2016. Based on the review of AssetWorks database and *School Bus Safety Inspection Forms*, we noted that 12 (5%) of the 240 sample inspections were performed beyond the maximum 30-school-day interval requirement, with delays ranging from one to three school days.

Management’s Response: Management concurs. Transportation has put new procedures in place which schedules inspections within the 30-day window, to insure 100% compliance going forward.

This page intentionally left blank.



THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FLORIDA

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
3318 FOREST HILL BLVD., C-306
WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406

(561) 434-7335 FAX: (561) 434-8652
www.palmbeachschools.org

LUNG CHIU, CIG, CPA
INSPECTOR GENERAL

SCHOOL BOARD
CHUCK SHAW, CHAIRMAN
DEBRA L. ROBINSON, M.D., VICE CHAIRWOMAN
MARCIA ANDREWS
FRANK A. BARBIERI, JR., ESQ.
KAREN M. BRILL
BARBARA MCQUINN
ERICA WHITFIELD

ROBERT M. AVOSSA, Ed.D., SUPERINTENDENT

MEMORANDUM

TO: Honorable Chair and Members of the School Board
Robert M. Avossa, Ed.D., Superintendent of Schools
Chair and Members of the Audit Committee

FROM: Lung Chiu, CPA, Inspector General

DATE: May 19, 2017

SUBJECT: Audit of School Bus Safety Inspections

PURPOSE AND AUTHORITY

Pursuant to the *Office of Inspector General's (OIG) 2015-16 Work Plan*, we have audited the School Bus Safety Inspections during Fiscal Year 2016. The primary objectives of this audit were to determine (1) if Post-Trip Passenger Check (Child Alert) and Video Surveillance Camera (Camera) Systems on school buses were in working conditions, (2) if school bus inspections were conducted by certified inspectors, and (3) if school buses were inspected within the required time interval.

SCOPE AND METHODOLOGY

The audit was performed in accordance with *Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards* promulgated by the Comptroller of the United States. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient and appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. The audit included:

- Interviewing staff
- Conducting on-site observations of safety devices for sample school buses
- Reviewing relevant rules and regulations, including:
 - *Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 6A-3, Transportation*
 - *Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Manual, 2008 Edition*
 - *Florida School Bus Specifications (Revised 2013)*
 - *School Board Policy #2.29, Maintenance and Repair of Automotive Equipment*
 - School District's *School Bus Drivers and Bus Attendants Handbook*
 - Sample School Bus Safety Inspection Records

Draft audit findings were sent to staff for review and comments. Management response is included in the Appendix. We appreciate the courtesy and cooperation extended to us by District staff during the audit. The final draft report was presented to the Audit Committee at its May 19, 2017, meeting.

BACKGROUND

Mission of Transportation Services Department. As stated in Transportation Department’s website, “*Our mission is to deliver students safely, efficiently, and on time to their destinations in a frame of mind ready to learn.*” According to the School District’s *Facts at a Glance Brochure (revised 9-1-2016)*⁽¹⁾, the School District transports 60,000 students daily, covering approximately 13 million miles per year. As of August 9, 2016, the District had 804 school buses assigned to six bus compounds in the county:

<u>Bus Compound</u>	<u># of Buses</u>
North	157
South	185
East	114
Royal Palm	103
Central	186
West	59
Total	<u>804</u>

Source: Transportation

Mandatory School Bus Safety Inspection. To ensure the safety for transporting students, all school buses are required to complete a safety inspection by certified inspectors, at a maximum interval of 30 school days, in accordance with *Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 6A-3.0171* and the *State of Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Manual, 2008 Edition*. Deficiencies identified during the safety inspection shall be documented on the *School Bus Safety Inspection Form*, and follow-up repairs of all safety related items be made and documented before the bus is returned to service.

⁽¹⁾ The brochure is available at <https://www.palmbeachschools.org/communications/wp-content/uploads/sites/52/2016/04/District-Facts-Brochure.pdf>.

CONCLUSIONS

The audit produced the following major conclusions.

1. Child Alert and Camera Systems

To determine if the Post-Trip Passenger Check System (Child Alert) and Video Surveillance Camera System (Camera) on school buses were functioning as intended, OIG conducted two on-site observations of the devices in a total of 150 sample buses during the audit.

Child Alert System. The Child Alert System is required for all buses manufactured since 2005. Specifically, *Inspection Procedures A.16.d.* of the Florida Department of Education's (DOE) *School Bus Safety Inspection Manual* states "*Check for proper operation of post-trip passenger check system (required on buses manufactured since 2005)*", and repair the system if it "*does not operate according to manufacturer's specifications, or is not working*".

The requirements for the Child Alert System contained in the DOE's *Florida School Bus Specifications*, states that "*The bus must be equipped with a system to require the driver to walk to the rearmost interior of the bus after each trip to deactivate the system via a push button and to ensure that no passengers are left on the bus.*"

Camera System. Each school bus is equipped with a Camera System. The Camera starts automatically in approximately 20 seconds after the bus ignition is turned on; and the LED amber light on the Camera's panic button will flash, indicating that the system is recording. The bus driver is required to check the panic button of the Camera before and after every trip to ensure the Camera System is in working condition.

I. OIG's May 2016 On-Site Observations

During May 11 through 24, 2016, OIG conducted on-site observations of the Child Alert and Camera Systems on 89 sample school buses at the District's six bus compounds.

Results

65% of Child Alert and 7% of Cameras Not Working. Our observations revealed that the Child Alert devices were not working for 58 (65%) of the sample buses; and the Cameras were not working for six (7%) of the sample buses.

35% of Child Alert Devices Manually Disconnected/Disabled. Furthermore, our observations noted that the Child Alert System was manually disconnected/disabled by someone on 31 of the 58 sample buses with a non-working Child Alert (please see Exhibit 1 on page 11 for pictures with Child Alert wiring manually disconnected).

Table 1
Summary of OIG Observation Results
Observations During May 11 through 24, 2016

Bus Compound	No. of Sample Buses Inspected	# of Sample Buses With Non-Working Systems			
		Non-Working Camera	Non-Working Child Alert System		
			System Failure	Manually Disconnected	Total Non-Working
North	15	1	3	6	9
South	14	1	2	7	9
East	15	1	8	0	8
Royal Palm	15	1	2	8	10
Central	15	2	4	8	12
West	15	0	8	2	10
Total	89 (100%)	6 (7%)	27 (30%)	31 (35%)	58 (65%)

Source: OIG On-Site Observations May 11-24, 2016

OIG Observation Results Provided to Staff for Immediate Corrective Actions. To ensure the safety for all students and employees, on June 9, 2016, OIG provided all observation results and preliminary conclusions to the Chief Operating Officer and Director of Transportation for immediate corrective actions.

Corrective Actions Reported by Transportation. On August 9, 2016, Transportation informed the OIG that only 18 (2%) and nine (1%) buses had non-working Child Alert and Camera respectively (Table 2), and those buses with non-working safety devices were not put in service transporting students, until after the devices have been repaired.

Table 2
Status of Bus Safety Devices as of August 9, 2016
Reported by Transportation

Buses Available Report							
Total	North	South	East	Royal Palm	Central	West	NOTES
Total Buses	157	185	114	103	186	59	804
Child Alert	151	184	114	94	184	55	782 (97%)
A/C	143	185	114	99	182	54	777 (97%)
GPS	151	185	111	103	183	59	792 (99%)
Camera	153	185	114	96	181	59	788 (98%)
Buses Needed Repairs	2	1	7	8	8	6	32 (3%)
Total Available	151	184	107	95	170	53	760 (94.5 %)
Total Routes	111	166	85	91	151	43	647
Surplus	46	19	29	12	35	16	157 (19.5%)
Not Working	North	South	East	Royal Palm	Central	West	
Child Alert	2	1	0	9	2	4	18 (2%)
A/C	10	0	0	4	5	5	24 (3%)
GPS	2	0	3	0	1	0	6 (.07%)
Camera	0	0	0	7	2	0	9 (1%)

Source: Transportation Services Department

II. OIG’s Follow-Up On-Site Observations in September 2016

Subsequent to Transportation’s August 9, 2016, *Corrective Action Report*, on September 7 and 8, 2016, OIG performed a follow-up on-site observations of the safety devices for another 61 sample buses at all six bus compounds, in order to ascertain the status of the reported corrective actions. These 61 sample buses were randomly selected from those buses that had been transporting students during those two days.

Results

The follow-up observations of the 61 sample buses found that the non-working Child Alert equipment has reduced significantly from 65% down to 21% of the sample buses. However, the follow-up observations found that:

- (a) Eleven (18%) of the sample buses had non-working Child Alert: 10 with system failure, and one manually disconnected.
- (b) Two (3%) of the sample buses had non-working Camera.
- (c) Two (3%) of the sample buses had both non-working Child Alert and Camera.

Table 3
Summary of OIG Follow-up Observation Results
September 7 and 8, 2016

Bus Compound	No. of Sample Buses	Number of Buses With Non-Working Devices				
		Child Alert System			Non-Working Camera (only)	Both Camera & Child Alert Non-Working
		System Failure	Manually Disconnected	Total Non-Working Child Alert (only)		
North	10	1	–	1	–	2
South	10	–	–	–	1	–
East	10	–	–	–	–	–
Royal Palm	11	4	–	4	–	–
Central	10	2	–	2	–	–
West	10	3	1	4	1	–
Total	61 (100%)	10 (16%)	1 (2%)	11 (18%)	2 (3%)	2 (3%)

Source: OIG’s Follow-up On-Site Observations on September 7 and 8, 2016

Buses With Non-Working Child Alert and Camera Referred to Transportation for Immediate Corrective Actions. To ensure safety for all students and employees, the list of vehicles identified with non-working Child Alert and Camera was provided to the Chief Operating Officer and Director of Transportation on September 12, 2016, for immediate corrective actions.

Mandatory Monthly Safety Inspections Not Effective in Identifying Defective Devices. Both Child Alert and Camera Systems are to be part of the required monthly⁽²⁾ safety inspections by certified inspectors. Our September 7 and 8, 2016, follow-up on-site observations found 15 (25%) of the 61 sample buses had non-working Child Alert or Camera. The latest Mandatory Monthly Safety Inspections for the 15 affected buses were completed by Transportation during July 6 and September 7, 2016. However, our review of the *Mandatory Safety Inspection Forms* found that only two buses (#4015 and #6004) were identified having non-working Child Alert; all the other sample buses were not identified with non-working devices.

Inconsistent Information Provided by Transportation

Non-Working Child Safety Equipment. As reported by Transportation during the audit, only 18 (2%) and nine (1%) buses had non-working Child Alert and Camera respectively as of August 9, 2016. However, OIG's September 7 and 8, 2016, follow-up on-site observations of 61 sample buses found 13 (21%) buses had non-working Child Alert and four (7%) buses with non-working Camera.

Daily Pre-Trip and Post-Trip Inspection Reports. Pursuant to *Florida Board of Education Rule 6A-3.0171, FAC*, and *Florida Statute Section 316.6135*, all bus drivers are required "to inspect the bus at least daily prior to the beginning of the first daily trip or more often as required by the school district" and "to perform a complete interior inspection of each bus after each run and trip to ensure no students are left on board."

District's procedures require bus drivers to perform daily Pre- and Post-Trip Inspections and document the inspection results on the *Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report* (please see Exhibit 2 on page 12). Our September 7 and 8, 2016, follow-up on-site observations found 13 (21%) of the 61 sample buses had non-working Child Alert. On September 21, 2016, Transportation provided OIG with the September 7, 2016, *Pre/Post-trip Inspection Reports* for 12 of the 13 buses. All 12 *Inspection Reports* did not indicate that there were problems with the Child Alert, which were contrary to the OIG follow-up observation results.

Recommendations

To protect the safety and welfare of students and District employees, OIG recommends that:

(A) Mandatory Monthly Safety Inspections be Conducted by Certified Inspectors

- Mandatory monthly safety inspections should be conducted by certified inspectors.
- Supervisory staff should conduct routine random checking of buses to ensure inspections are properly completed and all non-compliances are properly corrected in a timely manner.

⁽²⁾ Monthly means "at a maximum interval of thirty (30) school days", *Rule 6A-3.0171, FAC, Subsection (8)(c)*.

(B) Safety Devices (Child Alert and Camera Systems)

- Transportation should ensure all Child Alert and Camera Systems are in proper operational conditions when the buses are transporting students.
- Transportation should establish a procedure to ensure proper compliance by bus drivers that no student is left on a bus after each trip.
- Probable disciplinary measures should be considered for employees who disarmed Child Alert and/or Camera Systems.

(C) Daily Pre/Post Trip Inspections by Bus Drivers

- Transportation should enforce the requirements on *Form PBSD 0454 (Rev. 7/20/2016) – Bus Driver and Attendance Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report*, which has specific spaces to indicate defects with the Child Alert (box#30) and/or the Camera (box#20). The *Pre/Post-trip Inspection Reports* must be accurately completed by bus driver before and after each trip.
- Transportation coordinators/supervisors should review and monitor the daily *Bus Driver and Attendance Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report (PBSD 0454)* to ensure full compliance with safety requirements and that all defects found are noted by drivers and are repaired accordingly before putting the buses back to service.

Management's Response: *Management concurs. The following actions have been taken to correct the issues cited.*

(A) Mandatory Monthly Safety Inspections be Conducted by Certified Inspectors

Certification status is now monitored daily by a Facility Management Support Technician.

(B) Safety Devices (Child Alert and Camera Systems)

Child Alert Systems have now been placed in an internal compartment so that connectors are no longer exposed. Bus Drivers and Attendants found to be disarming the Child Alert and/or Camera Systems will be issued a memorandum. A random bus selection process will be implemented for Sr. Coordinators to check (10) buses a day for any child alert/camera issues. This process will be communicated to the Sr. Coordinators once finalized by the end of the 2016/17 school year.

(C) Daily Pre/Post Trip Inspections by Bus Drivers

Pre/Post trip forms are now reviewed daily by the supervisors at each facility for compliance. Bus Drivers and Attendants found to not be filling out the forms will be issued a memorandum. The importance and the consequences of not completing the forms will be emphasized at the in-service days. A process will be implemented by the end of the 2016/17 school year for the Foreperson to check buses daily for any child alert/camera issues before a bus is returned into service.

(Please see page 15.)

2. 392 School Bus Safety Inspections at West Compound During July 2014 through May 2016 Conducted by an Inspector With Expired Certification

Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 6A-3.0171 requires that school bus safety inspection be conducted by technicians certified as school bus inspectors in accordance with the *Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Manual*. Specifically, *FAC 6A-3.0171 (8)(d)*, states,

“School bus inspections shall be conducted by technicians certified as school bus inspectors in accordance with the State of Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Manual, 2008 Edition. The requirement that inspections be performed by a certified school bus inspector may be waived for a period not to exceed six (6) months when an emergency condition exists, upon written notification to the Commissioner by the district superintendent.”

The *Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Manual*, requires that all school bus safety inspection be documented on the *School Bus Safety Inspection Form* (please see Exhibit 3 on page 13), which is a checklist that includes all the safety items to be inspected monthly. The *Inspection Manual* states, “The “Inspector’s Signature” must be completed on each inspection form”, and “The inspection form must be initialed by the service manager or his/her delegate.”

We reviewed 140 *Safety Inspection Forms* for 70 sample buses during Fiscal Year 2016, and noted:

- 24 sample inspections were conducted by an inspector with expired certification
- 7 *Safety Inspection Forms* were not signed/initialed by the supervisor.

**Table 4
Sample Mandatory Safety Inspections
Completed by an Inspector With Expired Certification**

Bus Compound	# of Sample Buses	Sample Safety Inspection Forms During Fiscal Year 2016		
		Total # of Sample Inspections Reviewed	# of Inspections Not Signed / Initialed by Supervisor	# of Inspections Completed by the Inspector With Expired Certification
Central	10	20 (100%)	2 (10%)	–
East	10	20 (100%)	1 (5%)	–
North	10	20 (100%)	2 (10%)	–
Royal Palm	10	20 (100%)	1 (5%)	–
South	10	20 (100%)	–	–
West	20 ^(Note)	40 (100%)	1 (3%)	24 (60%)
Total	70	140 (100%)	7 (5%)	24 (17%)

Note: Our review of the initial 20 safety inspections for 10 sample buses revealed that some inspections were completed by a non-certified inspector. We expanded the sample size by 20 inspections for another 10 buses at the West Compound.

According to Transportation, this inspector’s certification expired in June 2014. OIG contacted the Florida Department of Education (FDOE) to verify the certification status of the concerned employee. According to FDOE, “His certificate expired on June 30, 2014, when he was reassigned.”

According to Transportation, this non-certified inspector conducted 392 school bus safety inspections during July 2014 through May 2016 while he was not certified, and did not conduct school bus safety inspection since May 12, 2016.

As indicated by the concerned employee in his May 27, 2016, written statement,

“I have occasionally been directed to inspect buses, after which (my supervisor) reviewed the work and initialed the documents after his completion of the work due to our need to keep buses on the road and to promote safety.”

The related employee’s supervisor indicated in his May 26, 2016, written statement that,

“Due to an occasional shortage of mechanical support as needed as well as the current workload, I permitted [the concerned staff] to bring buses into the shop, to check them out due to his mechanical knowledge and perform minimal repairs, given the urgent need. [He] was permitted to check several buses, conduct routine oil changes as well as minor reparations and I in return inspected ALL work for safety purposes without exception prior to vehicles being dispatched or leaving the compound or being placed back into service. I, in return placed my certification ID inspection # on the work order and submitted them to my immediate Supervisor.”

Recommendation

To ensure the safety and welfare of students, District employees, and the general public, Transportation should comply with **FAC 6A-3.0171(8)** and **Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Manual**, that

- All school bus safety inspection must be conducted by a certified school bus inspector.
- School bus safety inspections should be documented on the *Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Form*, signed by the certified inspector and reviewed and approved by the service manager or responsible designee.

Management’s Response: *Management concurs. As of May 13th, 2016, all mechanics on staff are certified. Certification status is now monitored daily by a Facility Management Support Technician. Procedures are now in place to ensure the Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Form is signed by a certified inspector and reviewed and approved by the service manager or designee.*

One additional staff member, a Facility Management Support Technician, now monitors the Mandatory Safety Inspections (MSI) daily. Today 100% of our Mechanics are State certified to conduct Mandatory Safety Inspections (MSI) on our school buses.

(Please see page 16.)

3. 5% of Sample Safety Inspections Performed Beyond the Maximum 30-School-Day Interval Requirement

Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 6A-3.0171(8)(c) Responsibilities of School Boards for Student Transportation, requires,

“Inspection of buses shall be scheduled and performed at a maximum interval of thirty (30) school days”

Transportation manages all District vehicles through the fleet maintenance management software, AssetWorks System. We reviewed 240 random samples of safety inspection records for 120 buses during Fiscal Year 2016. These samples included (a) 120 buses which were comprised of 20 buses from each of the six District’s bus compounds, and (b) two safety inspections for each of the 120 sample buses. Based on the AssetWorks database and *School Bus Safety Inspection Forms*, we compared the date for each inspection with the date of the prior inspection. Our examination of these 240 sample safety inspections revealed that 12 (5%) of them were performed beyond the maximum 30-school-day interval requirement, with delays ranging from one to three school days.

**Table 5
Sample Mandatory Safety Inspections
Performed Beyond the Maximum 30-Day Interval Requirement
During Fiscal Year 2016**

Location	# of Sample Buses	# of Sample Inspections Reviewed	# of Inspections Beyond the 30-Day Interval Requirement
Central	20	40 (100%)	8 (20%)
East	20	40 (100%)	–
North	20	40 (100%)	–
Royal Palm	20	40 (100%)	4 (10%)
South	20	40 (100%)	–
West	20	40 (100%)	–
Total	120	240 (100%)	12 (5%)

Source: Transportation Services’ AssetWorks System and School Bus Safety Inspection Forms.

Recommendation

To protect the safety and welfare of students, District employees, and the general public, Transportation should ensure all school bus safety inspections are completed within the maximum 30-day interval as required by *Florida Administrative Code (FAC) 6A-3.0171(8)(c)*.

Management’s Response: *Management concurs. Transportation has put new procedures in place which schedules inspections within the 30-day windows, to insure 100% compliance going forward. (Please see page 16.)*

– End of Report –

Exhibit 1
Sample Child Alert System with Manually Disconnected Wiring



Child Alert with Disconnected Wiring



Child Alert with Disconnected Wiring



Corrective Action: Reconnected Wiring with a Zip-Tie

Exhibit 2

Bus Driver and Attendant Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report

THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY

Bus Driver and Attendant Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report

Vehicle #	Odometer/Beginning #	Odometer/Ending #	Time/Pre-trip	Time/Post-trip	Date
CHECK PRE TRIP DEFECTS <input type="checkbox"/> 1. Brakes <input type="checkbox"/> 11. Windows; Windshield <input type="checkbox"/> 21. Air Leaks <input type="checkbox"/> 2. Lights <input type="checkbox"/> 12. Emergency Door <input type="checkbox"/> 22. Fuel Odor <input type="checkbox"/> 3. Horn <input type="checkbox"/> 13. Emergency Equipment <input type="checkbox"/> 23. Exhaust Fumes <input type="checkbox"/> 4. Wipers <input type="checkbox"/> 14. Emergency Exit Buzzer <input type="checkbox"/> 24. Muffler; Tail Pipe <input type="checkbox"/> 5. Gauges <input type="checkbox"/> 15. Steering <input type="checkbox"/> 25. Student Mirror <input type="checkbox"/> 6. Heaters <input type="checkbox"/> 16. Tire condition <input type="checkbox"/> 26. Exterior Mirrors <input type="checkbox"/> 7. Defrosters <input type="checkbox"/> 17. Rims; Seals; Lug nuts <input type="checkbox"/> 27. Body Dents <input type="checkbox"/> 8. Seats <input type="checkbox"/> 18. Fluid Leaks <input type="checkbox"/> 28. Stop Signs <input type="checkbox"/> 9. Engine <input type="checkbox"/> 19. Transmission <input type="checkbox"/> 29. Crossing Arm <input type="checkbox"/> 10. GPS <input type="checkbox"/> 20. Camera System <input type="checkbox"/> 30. Child Alert				CHECK POST-TRIP <input type="checkbox"/> 1. All electrical systems off <input type="checkbox"/> 2. Searched for children/lost items <input type="checkbox"/> 3. Displayed empty sign <input type="checkbox"/> 4. Swept floor; cleaned bus as needed <input type="checkbox"/> 5. Emptied trash can <input type="checkbox"/> 6. Closed all windows, hatches and doors <input type="checkbox"/> 7. Exterior has no leaks or new damage <input type="checkbox"/> 8. Checked tire condition; lug nuts	
SHOP REPORT Bus in service <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Defect Corrected <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Signature of Mechanic _____ Date _____			REMARKS _____ _____ _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Post-trip completed (Required)		
			Signature of Driver _____ Date _____		

PBSD 0454 (Rev. 7/20/2016)

THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY

Bus Driver and Attendant Pre/Post-trip Inspection Report

Vehicle #	Odometer/Beginning #	Odometer/Ending #	Time/Pre-trip	Time/Post-trip	Date
CHECK PRE TRIP DEFECTS <input type="checkbox"/> 1. Brakes <input type="checkbox"/> 11. Windows; Windshield <input type="checkbox"/> 21. Air Leaks <input type="checkbox"/> 2. Lights <input type="checkbox"/> 12. Emergency Door <input type="checkbox"/> 22. Fuel Odor <input type="checkbox"/> 3. Horn <input type="checkbox"/> 13. Emergency Equipment <input type="checkbox"/> 23. Exhaust Fumes <input type="checkbox"/> 4. Wipers <input type="checkbox"/> 14. Emergency Exit Buzzer <input type="checkbox"/> 24. Muffler; Tail Pipe <input type="checkbox"/> 5. Gauges <input type="checkbox"/> 15. Steering <input type="checkbox"/> 25. Student Mirror <input type="checkbox"/> 6. Heaters <input type="checkbox"/> 16. Tire condition <input type="checkbox"/> 26. Exterior Mirrors <input type="checkbox"/> 7. Defrosters <input type="checkbox"/> 17. Rims; Seals; Lug nuts <input type="checkbox"/> 27. Body Dents <input type="checkbox"/> 8. Seats <input type="checkbox"/> 18. Fluid Leaks <input type="checkbox"/> 28. Stop Signs <input type="checkbox"/> 9. Engine <input type="checkbox"/> 19. Transmission <input type="checkbox"/> 29. Crossing Arm <input type="checkbox"/> 10. GPS <input type="checkbox"/> 20. Camera System <input type="checkbox"/> 30. Child Alert				CHECK POST-TRIP <input type="checkbox"/> 1. All electrical systems off <input type="checkbox"/> 2. Searched for children/lost items <input type="checkbox"/> 3. Displayed empty sign <input type="checkbox"/> 4. Swept floor; cleaned bus as needed <input type="checkbox"/> 5. Emptied trash can <input type="checkbox"/> 6. Closed all windows, hatches and doors <input type="checkbox"/> 7. Exterior has no leaks or new damage <input type="checkbox"/> 8. Checked tire condition; lug nuts	
SHOP REPORT Bus in service <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Defect Corrected <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No Signature of Mechanic _____ Date _____			REMARKS _____ _____ _____ <input type="checkbox"/> Post-trip completed (Required)		
			Signature of Driver _____ Date _____		

PBSD 0454 (Rev. 7/20/2016)

Exhibit 3

School Bus Safety Inspection Form (Page 1 of 2)



THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF PALM BEACH COUNTY SCHOOL BUS SAFETY INSPECTION FORM

Status Code Bus # _____ Mileage: _____ Hours: _____ WO#: **CEN-** _____ Date: ___/___/___
 = Item OK Chassis/Body: _____/_____ Capacity: _____ Model Year: _____
 = Needs Repair (or as noted)
 = Out of Service Shop Location: **CENTRAL** Lift Equipped: Yes or No (circle) Next Inspection Due: _____
 = Not Applicable

Status Code	INSPECTION ITEMS	COMMENTS (Note Specific Deficiencies)	Tech. Init.
	A. INSIDE BUS (REQUIRED)		
	1. Emergency Equipment – Fire Ext. (pressure, tag, mount), First Aid Kit, Body Fluid Cleanup Kit and Reflectors.		
	2. Registration and Insurance Card		
	3. Neutral Safety Switch, Shifter and Noise Abatement Switch		
	4. Engine Controls – Key Switch, Choke, Accelerator, and Engine Shutdown.		
	5. Gauges, Indicators & Dash Lights, Engine Warning Lights, Buzzers and ABS Warning Light.		
	6. Air Brake System – Gauge(s), Build-Up, Governor, Park Brake, Adjustment, Air Leaks, Low Air Warning, PP-1 Pop-Off, and Pedal.		
	7. Hydraulic Brake System – Warning Light, Gauge, Pedal, Travel & Fade, Power Assist, and Park Brake.		
	8. Windshield Wipers & Washers – Operation, Park, and Blades.		
	9. Heaters, Defrosters, and External Dash Fan(s).		
	10. Dome and Step Well Lights		
	11. Service Door – Operation, Control and Overhead Pad.		
	12. Horn(s)		
	13. Mirror Adjustment, Condition – Rearview, Convex, and Interior.		
	14. Driver's Seat and Seat Belt		
	15. Passenger Seats – Frames, Mounting, Pads, Cuts, Bottoms, Modesty Panels, Stanchions, Passenger Securement Devices, and Webbing Cutter.		
	16. Emergency Door(s) Windows/Hatches – Operation, Buzzers, Labeling & Overhead Pad, and Passenger Check System (CRS) Operation.		
	17. Windshield, Side & Rear Windows – Cracks, Fogging, Latches, and Visor.		
	18. Wheelchair Lift, Door, and Securement System – (if equipped).		
	19. 2 Way Radio Operation, GPS, Video and P.A. Systems – (if equipped).		
	20. Interior Wiring, Cab Hoses and Fire Wall Seals		
	21. General Condition, Bus Interior – Floor, Step Well, Grab Rail(s), Paneling, Broom Mounting, Loose Objects Secured, and Engine Cover.		
	B. OUTSIDE BUS (REQUIRED)		
	1. Headlights, Turn Signals, Hazard, Side Marker, Brake, Tail, Backup Lights, Backup Alarm & Dash Sticker (if equipped) and Park Lights.		
	2. Clearance & ID Lights, Reflectors, and Strobe Light (if equipped).		
	3. Pupil Warning Lights – (see eight light warning system chart).		
	4. Stop Arm(s), and Student Crossing Arm – Wiring, Air or Vacuum Leak and Decal		
	5. General Condition, Bus Exterior – Mirrors, Bumpers, Body Damage, Paint, Reflective Marking, Lettering, Emergency Door, Engine Hood, & Cleanliness.		
	C. ENGINE COMPARTMENT (REQUIRED)		
	1. Steering – Play, Column, Steering Gear Box Mounting, Pitman Arm, Drag Link, Steering Arm, Tie Rod & Ends and Idler Arm.		
	2. Batteries – Hold Down, Terminals, Cables, Cleanliness, Slide Tray, & Load Test.		
	3. Fluid Levels and Condition – Brake, Power Steering, Oil, Transmission, Windshield Washer, Coolant, and DEF _____ % & Antifreeze _____°F		
	4. Belts & Hoses – Tightness, Condition, Routing, and Belt Alignment.		
	5. Accessory Mounting & Condition – Air Cleaner (Restriction _____"H2O), P.S. Pump, Air Compressor & Filter, Water Pump, Fan and Alternator.		
	6. Wiring – Routing and Condition.		

Exhibit 2

School Bus Safety Inspection Form (Page 2 of 2)

Status Code	INSPECTION ITEMS	COMMENTS (Note Specific Deficiencies)	Tech. Init.
	7. Fuel System and Lines		
	8. Radiator – Mounting, Cap, Reservoir, and Fan Shroud		
D. UNDERNEATH BUS (REQUIRED)			
	1. Front Suspension – Wheel Bearings, I-Beam (King Pins, Shackles, Spring Mounts, Pins & Bushings), A-Frames and Bushings (Ball Joints), U-Bolts, Shocks, Springs and Seals.		
	2. Front Brakes – Hoses, lines, Chambers, Slack Adjusters, Pushrods, Linings, Drums, Rotors, Wheel Cylinders or Calipers. Check and Adjust MSA Equipped Brakes. Do Not Adjust Automatic Slack Adjuster (ASA) Equipped Brakes		
	3. Engine/Transmission Mounts, Starter Mounting.		
	4. Transmission – Bolts, Linkage, Lines, Filter and Cooler, & Clutch (if equipped).		
	5. Fluid Leaks – Oil, Coolant, Transmission, Power Steering, etc.		
	6. Fuel Tank – Leaks, Mounting, Hoses, and Wiring.		
	7. Brake Equipment – ABS, Lines, Valves, Reservoir Mounting, and Bleed Reservoirs.		
	8. Driveline – Shafts, U-Joints, Yokes, Hanger Bearings, Guards, and Driveshaft Park Brake.		
	9. Rear Suspension – Afe Housing, Vent, Differential, Springs, U-Bolts, Shocks, Spring Shackles, Pins and Bushings, Hangers, Seals, and Wheel Bearings.		
	10. Rear Brakes – Hoses, Lines, Chambers, Slack Adjusters, Pushrods, Linings, Drums, Rotors, Wheel Cylinders or Calipers. Check and Adjustment MSA Equipped Brakes. Do not adjust Auto Slack Adjuster (ASA) Equipped Brakes		
	11. Body Securement & Structure – Hold Downs, Floor, Outriggers, Braces, Skirts, and Chassis Frame Rails.		
	12. Exhaust Systems – Leaks, Mounting, Muffler, and Tailpipe.		
	13. Wheels and Tires – Tread Depth, Pressure, Damage, Matching, Alignment, and Wheel Hardware.		
E. LUBRICATION & MAINTENANCE (OPTIONAL)			
	1. Change Oil and Replace Oil Filter(s) quarts _____		
	2. Replace Fuel Filter(s) Primary/Secondary and Drain Separator		
	3. Replace Transmission Filter(s) quarts _____		
	4. Replace Air Compressor Filter (if applicable)		
	5. Replace Power Steering Filter pints _____		
	6. Replace Engine Air Cleaner Filter		
	7. Replace Coolant and Filter (if applicable)		
	8. Test Starting and Charging System Amps _____ Volts _____		
	9. Lubricate Chassis and Body - as needed lbs. _____		
	10. Air Conditioning - Perform A/C system preventive maintenance (if equipped) according to manufacturer/district procedure(s)		
F. ROAD TEST (REQUIRED)			
	1. Brake Performance – Park Brake, Stopping Distance and Equalization.		
	2. Engine, Transmission, Driveline – Engine Performance Governor, & Shifting.		
	3. Steering & Handling – Free Play, Power Assist, Turning Radius, Column, Tracking.		

Comments: _____ **Depth / Pressure** **Depth / Pressure**
 _____ RF _____/32 _____ RRO _____/32 _____
 _____ _____ _____ RRI _____/32 _____
 _____ _____ _____ LRI _____/32 _____
 _____ LF _____/32 _____ LRO _____/32 _____

NOTE: If bus is equipped with optional equipment not noted on this form, follow the manufacturer's inspection and maintenance procedures for that equipment.

INSPECTOR'S SIGNATURE _____ INSPECTOR'S CERTIFICATION #: 50 - _____

SERVICE MANAGER'S OR DELEGATE'S INITIALS: _____ BUS RETURNED TO SERVICE DATE: ____/____/____

Rev. 08/29/14

Management's Response

THE SCHOOL DISTRICT OF
PALM BEACH COUNTY, FL

DONALD E. FENNOY, II, Ed.D.
CHIEF OPERATING OFFICER

ROBERT M. AVOSSA, Ed.D.
SUPERINTENDENT



CHIEF OPERATING OFFICE
3300 FOREST HILL BOULEVARD, B-302
WEST PALM BEACH, FL 33406
PHONE: 561-357-7573 / FAX: 561-357-7569
WWW.PALMBEACHSCHOOLS.ORG/COO

RECEIVED
APR 25 2017
INSPECTOR GENERAL

MEMORANDUM

TO: Lung Chiu, Inspector General

FROM: Donald Fennoy, II, Ed.D., Chief Operating Officer *DeFF*

DATE: April 13, 2017

SUBJECT: Management Response – Audit of School Bus Safety Inspections

Following is the Management Response to the Audit of School Bus Safety Inspections, dated March 10, 2017.

1. Child Alert Alarm and Camera Systems

Management Concur. The following actions have been taken to correct the issues cited.

(A) Mandatory Monthly Safety Inspections be Conducted by Certified Inspectors

Certification Status is now monitored daily by a Facility Management Support Technician

(B) Safety Devices (Child Alert and Camera Systems)

Child Alert Systems have now been placed in an internal compartment so that the connectors are no longer exposed. Bus Drivers and Attendants found to be disarming the Child Alert and/or Camera Systems will be issued a memorandum. A random bus selection process will be implemented for Sr. Coordinators to check (10) buses a day for any child alert/camera issues. This process will be communicated to the Sr. Coordinators once finalized by the end of the 2016/17 school year.

(C) Daily Pre/Post Trip Inspections by Bus Drivers

Pre/Post trip forms are now reviewed daily by the supervisors at each facility for compliance. Bus Drivers and Attendants found to not be filling out the forms will be issued a memorandum. The importance and the consequences of not completing the forms will be emphasized at the in-service days. A process will be implemented by the end of the

Ms

Management's Response

2016/17 school year for the Foreperson to check buses daily for any child alert/camera issues before a bus is returned into service.

2. 392 School Bus Inspections at West Compound During July 2014 through May 2016 conducted by an Inspector with expired certification.

Management Concur. As of May 13th, 2016, all mechanics on staff are certified. Certification status is now monitored daily by a Facility Management Support Technician. Procedures are now in place to ensure the Florida School Bus Safety Inspection Form is signed by a certified inspector and reviewed and approved by the service manager or designee.

One additional staff member, a Facility Management Support Technician, now monitors the Mandatory Safety Inspections (MSI) daily. Today 100% of our Mechanics are State certified to conduct Mandatory Safety Inspections (MSI) on our school buses.

3. 5% of sample safety inspections not performed within the maximum 30-school day interval requirement.

Management Concur. Transportation has put new procedures in place which schedules inspections within the 30-day window, to insure 100% compliance going forward.

M